

**New York Lawyers'  
Practical Skills Series**



Includes Forms  
on CD

# Representing the Personal Injury Plaintiff in New York

Patrick J. Higgins, Esq.

2012–2013

NEW YORK STATE BAR ASSOCIATION



## CONTENTS

I.	Introduction.....	1
II.	Evaluating and Accepting the Personal Injury Case.....	1
	A. Why Represent Injured Clients?.....	1
	B. Initial Considerations.....	1
	1. Initial Client Interview.....	1
	2. Client Issues.....	3
	3. Evaluating the Case After Meeting the Client.....	4
	4. The Gut Check—Client Evaluation.....	7
	C. Mandatory Retainer Requirements.....	7
	1. Contingency Fee.....	7
	2. Liens.....	8
	3. Closing Statement.....	8
	4. Client Disbursements.....	9
III.	Investigating the Case.....	9
	A. Witnesses.....	9
	1. Adverse Party Witness.....	9
	2. Non-Party Witness.....	10
	3. Non-Party Damages Witness.....	11
	B. Investigating Your Client.....	11
	C. Evidence—Find and Preserve.....	13
IV.	Substantive Law of Personal Injury.....	14
	A. What Is the Legal Basis for the Injured Plaintiff’s Recovery?.....	14
	B. Common Law Theories.....	14
	1. Negligence.....	14
	2. Comparative Negligence and Assumption of Risk.....	15
	3. Res Ipsa Loquitur.....	15
	C. Statutory Causes of Action.....	16
	1. Labor Law §§ 240(1), 241(6), and 200(1).....	16
	a. Labor Law § 240(1).....	16
	b. Labor Law § 240(1) Defenses.....	18
	c. Labor Law § 200(1).....	20
	d. Labor Law § 241(6).....	20
	2. Investigating a Labor Law Case.....	21
	a. N.Y. Vehicle and Traffic Law § 388(1) (VTL).....	21
	b. Dram Shop Act Claims—General Obligations Law § 11-101.....	21
	c. 42 U.S.C. § 1983 and § 1985 Claims.....	22
	d. Wrongful Death Causes of Action—N.Y. Estates, Powers, and Trusts Law 5-4.1–5-4.6 (EPTL).....	22
	e. Judiciary Law § 487.....	22
	f. New York General Business Law §§ 349, 350 (GBL).....	22
	g. Informed Consent—N.Y. Public Health Law § 2805-d (PHL).....	22
	h. Navigation Law § 181.....	23
	D. Actions Based on Intent.....	23

V.	Medical Malpractice Action .....	23
	A. Substantive Framework and Recent Developments .....	23
	B. Vicarious Liability .....	24
	1. The <i>Mduba</i> Doctrine—Vicarious Liability in the Emergency Room .....	24
	2. Vicarious Liability in Hospitals.....	24
	3. Vicarious Liability in the Private Practice Clinic or Office .....	26
	C. Investigation of the Medical Malpractice Action .....	26
	D. HIPAA .....	27
	E. The <i>Arons</i> Doctrine.....	28
	1. The Content of <i>Arons</i> Authorizations .....	29
	2. <i>Arons</i> Authorizations Directed to Co-Defendants and Unknown Physicians ...	30
	3. Plaintiffs’ Right to <i>Arons</i> Authorizations for Defendants’ Physicians in Appropriate Case .....	30
	4. <i>Arons</i> and the Designated Trial Expert Under CPLR 3101(d)(1) .....	30
	5. The Timing of <i>Arons</i> Authorizations .....	31
	F. Medical Malpractice Procedure .....	31
	1. Statute of Limitations .....	31
	2. Continuous Treatment .....	32
	3. Certificate of Merit .....	33
	4. Mandatory Filing and Pre-Calendar Conferences .....	34
	G. Medical Malpractice Discovery .....	35
	1. Hospital Internal and Quality Assurance Records and Statements .....	35
	2. Non-Privileged Medical Malpractice Records .....	36
	3. Prior Transcripts and Lawsuits of Defendant Physicians.....	37
	4. Physical Testing and Discovery .....	37
	5. Depositions in Medical Malpractice Actions .....	37
	6. Discovery Concerning the Defendant Physician.....	37
	7. Medical Malpractice Expert Disclosure .....	38
	8. <i>Frye</i> and Medical Malpractice Actions .....	40
	9. Medical Privilege Issues for Plaintiffs .....	42
	H. Summary Judgment in Medical Malpractice Actions.....	43
	I. Medical Malpractice Trial Practice.....	44
	1. Trial Court Considerations .....	44
	2. Appellate Considerations in Medical Malpractice Actions.....	44
VI.	Products Liability Action.....	45
	A. Investigation.....	46
	B. Summary Judgment in Product Defect Cases.....	48
VII.	Premises Liability Action .....	48
	A. Substantive Framework .....	48
	B. Defenses to Premises Liability Actions .....	50
	C. Investigating the Premises Liability Action.....	51
	D. Tort Liability Based on Contract Obligations.....	52
	E. Snow and Ice Cases .....	52
	F. Summary Judgment Decisions in Premises Liability Cases.....	53
VIII.	Automobile Negligence Case .....	54
	A. Initial Client Issues .....	54

B.	Investigating the Automobile Negligence Case.....	55
C.	No-Fault Coverage.....	56
	1. Generally .....	56
	2. First-Party Benefits (Basic Economic Loss) .....	57
	a. Entitlements and Offsets.....	57
	(1) Medical (Causally Related) .....	57
	(2) Wages.....	57
	(3) Prescriptions.....	58
	(4) Mileage .....	58
	(5) Home Assistance.....	58
	b. Stacking .....	58
	c. No-Fault Liens .....	58
D.	Uninsured Claims—Motor Vehicle Accident Indemnification Corporation Act (MVAIC) .....	59
	1. Background.....	59
	2. Uninsured Tortfeasor—MVAIC .....	60
	3. Claimant Categories .....	60
	4. Uninsured Policy Coverage.....	60
	5. Policy Insured Claim Filing Procedures.....	61
	6. MVAIC Claim Filing .....	62
	a. No Insurance.....	62
	b. No Insurance—Identity of Wrongdoer Is Not Ascertainable (Hit and Run).....	62
	7. Insurance Initially Believed to Exist—No Insurance After Later Disclaimer by Carrier.....	63
	8. Failure to File or Late Filing .....	63
	9. Application to the Court .....	64
	10. Claim Resolution .....	64
	a. Insured Person .....	64
	b. Qualified Person .....	65
	11. Underinsured Tortfeasor—Supplemental Uninsured Coverage.....	66
	12. Investigating and Presenting Claim.....	67
	a. Time Limits for Making the SUM Claim.....	68
	b. Form of the Notice of Claim.....	69
	c. Conditions Precedent to Making a SUM Claim .....	69
	13. Triggering Underinsured Coverage.....	71
	a. Interplay Between SUM and Serious Injury Threshold .....	71
	b. Offsets.....	71
	c. Conclusion .....	72
E.	Litigating the Automobile Negligence Case.....	72
	1. No-Fault Serious Injury Threshold.....	72
	2. Case Precedents Analyzing Serious Injury Categories .....	73
	a. Death.....	73
	b. Dismemberment.....	73
	c. Significant Disfigurement.....	74
	d. Fracture .....	75

e.	Loss of Fetus.....	75
f.	Permanent Loss of Use of a Body Organ, Member, Function or System.....	75
g.	Permanent Consequential Limitation of Use of a Body Organ or Member ..	76
h.	Significant Limitation of Use of Body Function or System.....	77
i.	Medically Determined Injury or Impairment .....	77
j.	The Need for Objective Medical Proof of Injury .....	79
k.	Defenses to a Serious Injury Threshold Claim .....	79
l.	Cases Where Summary Judgment Denied to Defendant on Serious Injury Claim.....	80
m.	Cases Where Summary Judgment Granted Dismissing Serious Injury Claims.....	81
3.	Pre-Judgment Interest on Liability Verdicts and Inquests Involving the Serious Injury Threshold .....	81
F.	Defenses to the Automobile Negligence Action.....	82
1.	Seat Belt Defense .....	82
a.	Seat Belt Defense Cannot Be Admitted on Liability.....	82
b.	Seat Belts Must Be Available for the Defense to Apply .....	83
c.	Seat Belt Defense Can Be Waived .....	84
d.	Seat Belt Defense Needs Competent Expert Proof.....	84
e.	Jury Can Disregard Defense Proof on Seat Belt Use .....	85
2.	Emergency Doctrine.....	86
IX.	Claims Against Municipalities.....	86
A.	Notice-of-Claim Requirements.....	87
B.	Service of Notice of Claim .....	87
C.	Application for Leave to Serve a Late Notice .....	88
D.	Provisions Governing Claims Against Municipalities.....	88
1.	Examination Provisions.....	88
2.	Lawsuit Provisions .....	88
3.	Municipalities and the Special Duty Rule—Governmental Propriety Continuum .....	89
X.	Claims Against the State.....	95
A.	The Right to Sue .....	95
B.	Notice of Intention to File a Claim .....	95
C.	The Claim .....	95
D.	Filing Requirements.....	95
E.	Verification of Claim .....	96
F.	Practical Notes .....	96
XI.	Pleadings and Service of Process.....	97
A.	Generally.....	97
B.	Summons .....	97
C.	Complaint.....	98
1.	General Requirements .....	98
2.	Specific Pleading Requirements.....	98
3.	Suing an Unknown Party—The Jane Doe Designation .....	99
D.	Demand for Relief (Wherefore Clause).....	99

E.	Responsive Pleadings .....	100
1.	Review .....	100
2.	Affirmative Defenses.....	100
3.	Procedure to Remove .....	100
F.	Cross-Claims and Counterclaims.....	101
1.	Cross-Claims .....	101
2.	Counterclaims.....	101
G.	Service of Process.....	101
1.	Personal Service .....	102
2.	Personal Service by Mail.....	102
3.	Substituted Service (Nonpersonal Service).....	102
a.	Delivery to a Person of Suitable Age and Discretion.....	102
b.	Service Upon an Agent for Service .....	103
c.	“Nail and Mail” .....	103
d.	Publication .....	103
4.	Various Entities and Statutory Cites.....	103
5.	Service Under the Business Corporation Law (BCL) .....	104
6.	Service on Nonresident Motorists .....	105
7.	Service on Resident Motorists for Whom No Address Is Known.....	105
8.	Last Resort for Effecting Service .....	105
XII.	Discovery .....	106
A.	Introduction.....	106
B.	Scope and Standard.....	106
C.	Electronic Discovery.....	106
D.	Confidentiality .....	106
E.	Expert Witness Disclosure—Nonmedical Malpractice Action .....	107
F.	Timeliness of Expert Disclosure.....	107
1.	Expert Disclosure for Economists .....	108
2.	Sufficiency of Expert Disclosure.....	108
3.	Remedies for Deficient Expert Disclosure .....	108
4.	Treating Physicians and Expert Disclosure .....	111
5.	Third Judicial District Expert Disclosure Rule .....	112
G.	Statement of a Party .....	112
H.	Insurance Information.....	113
I.	Accident Reports.....	113
J.	Amendment or Supplementation .....	114
K.	Videotapes, Audiotapes and Photographs .....	114
L.	Medical Reports and Authorizations .....	114
1.	Mental Health and Counseling Records .....	115
2.	Non-Party Medical Privilege Issues .....	116
3.	Defendant Medical Privilege Issues .....	117
M.	Medical Examinations .....	117
N.	Bill of Particulars .....	118
1.	General Requirements .....	118
2.	Procedure.....	119

3.	Specific Objections and Commonly Disputed Items.....	119
a.	Demands for Disclosure of Expert Information in a Bill of Particulars .....	119
b.	Bill of Particulars in a Medical Malpractice Case .....	120
c.	Demands for Statutes, Ordinances and Laws in a Bill of Particulars .....	120
d.	Demand for Evidentiary Information in a Bill of Particulars .....	121
e.	Demand for a Breakdown of Future or General Damages in a Bill of Particulars .....	122
f.	Overbroad and Burdensome Demands in a Demand.....	122
g.	Related Items .....	122
h.	Bill of Particulars in Personal Injury Actions.....	123
i.	Supplemental and Amended Bills of Particulars .....	123
O.	Depositions—Oral and Written Questions .....	124
1.	Objections and Directions Not to Answer at a Party Deposition .....	125
2.	Depositions of Non-Parties Under the Deposition Rules—The Role of the Non-Party Witness Counsel .....	126
3.	Notice Requirements .....	127
4.	Deposition Location .....	128
5.	Preparing to Depose the Opposing Party.....	129
6.	Preparing Your Client for Deposition .....	129
7.	Conduct of the Deposition.....	130
8.	Production of Documents .....	130
9.	Reviewing the Transcript .....	130
P.	Production of Documents From a Non-Party .....	131
Q.	Discovery and Inspection.....	131
1.	Request for Production of Documents From a Party.....	131
a.	General Standards.....	131
b.	Objection and Waiver .....	132
c.	Educational Records .....	132
d.	Tax Returns.....	132
e.	Miscellaneous Documents Held Discoverable .....	133
2.	Right to Enter Land or Inspect Things .....	134
3.	Interrogatories.....	135
4.	Standard for a Protective Order .....	136
5.	Sanctions.....	137
6.	Spoilation.....	137
R.	Preliminary Conference and Its Impact on Disclosure .....	137
XIII.	The Summary Judgment Motion .....	139
A.	Introduction.....	139
B.	Court’s Duty .....	139
C.	Time of Motion.....	139
D.	Burden.....	140
1.	Movant.....	140
2.	Opposing Party .....	141
3.	The Reply Papers.....	142

XIV.	Settlement .....	142
	A. Are You My Client? .....	142
	1. Mr. and Mrs. Jones—Living Adults With No Liens .....	142
	2. Mr. and Mrs. Jones—Bankruptcy .....	143
	3. Mr. and Mrs. Jones—Divorce .....	145
	B. Do I Have the Authority to Settle the Case?.....	145
	1. Infant Settlement .....	146
	2. Wrongful Death Case .....	146
	C. Are Other Parties Involved in the Settlement? Liens, Subrogation and Contractual and Equitable Reimbursement .....	147
	1. Evaluating and Assessing Liens and Rights of Subrogation .....	147
	2. Liens and Rights of Subrogation .....	149
	D. Medical Benefits Carrier Liens and Claimed Rights of Recovery .....	150
	E. Release .....	150
	F. Requirements for a Binding Settlement.....	150
	G. Current Issues in Reaching Binding Settlement Agreements and Medicare .....	153
	1. Avoiding the Danger Zone—The Not-Really-Settled Case.....	154
	2. Knowing the Law—Reasons for the Plaintiff’s Positions.....	155
	a. Plaintiff’s Counsel Cannot Indemnify the Defendant .....	155
	b. Medicare as a Co-Payee on the Settlement Check .....	156
	c. Cases Deciding Whether Settlements Are Enforceable.....	156
	d. New York Cases Involving Releases, Medicare Forms and W-9s.....	157
	e. Medicare and Wrongful Death Allocations.....	158
	f. Confidentiality Orders .....	159
XV.	Expert Testimony .....	159
	A. New York’s <i>Frye</i> Test for Novel Scientific or Other Expert Evidence.....	159
	B. <i>Frye</i> Exposure Cases .....	161
	C. Other <i>Frye</i> Decisions .....	161
	D. New York’s Traditional Evidentiary Requirements for Experts .....	164
	1. Qualification .....	164
	2. Foundation.....	165
	3. Custom and Practice Expert Opinions.....	166
	E. Federal <i>Daubert/Kumho Tire</i> Expert Standards Under FRE 702 .....	167
	F. Specific Cases Involving the <i>Daubert/Kumho Tire</i> Standard.....	168
	1. Judicial Application of <i>Daubert/Kumho Tire</i> to Preclude Experts .....	168
	2. Judicial Application of <i>Daubert/Kumho Tire</i> to Admit Experts .....	169
	G. Procedure Under the <i>Daubert/Kumho Tire</i> Standard .....	170
	1. What Is the Burden of Proof?.....	170
	2. Is a Hearing Necessary? .....	170
	3. How Should the <i>Daubert/Kumho Tire</i> Hearing Be Conducted.....	170
	4. What Is the Standard of Appellate Review .....	171
	H. Use of Federal <i>Daubert/Kumho Tire</i> Expert Standards in New York State Court.....	171
XVI.	Conduit Hearsay .....	172
	A. The Problem.....	172
	B. The Solution.....	173



C.	Criteria for Showing Professional Reliability.....	173
D.	Illustrative Decision on Professional Reliability .....	174
XVII.	Trial.....	175
A.	Recent Decisions of Interest in Trial Practice .....	175
B.	Preparing for Trial—Some Threshold Advice.....	177
C.	Undisclosed Witnesses and Photographs at Trial .....	178
D.	Trial Theme.....	179
E.	Voir Dire (Jury Selection).....	179
1.	General Rules .....	179
2.	Purpose .....	180
3.	Procedure.....	180
4.	Selection Concepts .....	181
F.	Opening Statements .....	182
G.	Direct Examination .....	183
H.	Cross-Examination.....	183
I.	Demonstrative Evidence .....	184
J.	Trial Experts and Evidence Issues .....	185
K.	Summation .....	186
L.	Jury Instructions.....	187
M.	Post-Trial Matters .....	188
N.	Appeal and Appellate Issues.....	188
O.	Damages.....	188
P.	Recent Decisions of Interest on Damages and Verdicts .....	189
Appendix A	CPLR 2302, 3112 Amendments (Issuance of Subpoena for Patient Medical Records Without Patient Authorization).....	191
Appendix B	CPLR 1008 Amendments (Prohibits Third-Party Defendant Objections on Basis of Improper Service) .....	195
Appendix C	New Service Time Requirements for Notices of Motions and Cross-Motions .....	199
	Personal Injury Forms Index.....	203
	Table of Authorities .....	409
	About the Author .....	443

# **PERSONAL INJURY FORMS**

## INDEX OF FORMS\*

### A. INTAKE AND CLIENT RETENTION

Sample Client Interview Sheet.....	205
Judicial Conference Retainer Statement .....	225
Statement of Client's Rights .....	227
Statement of Client's Responsibilities .....	229

### B. INVESTIGATION AND SECURING OF MEDICAL AND OTHER RECORDS

HIPAA Compliant Unlimited Authorization for Plaintiff's Counsel to Secure Client's Records .....	231
HIPAA Compliant Authorization to Release Health Information Needed for Litigation .....	233
Authorization to Permit Interview of Treating Physician by Defense Counsel.....	235
HIPAA Compliant Limited Authorization Sent by Plaintiff's Counsel to Defense Counsel or Defense Representative to Allow Release of Records, but Without Conversation or Other Communication.....	237
Letter from Plaintiff's Counsel to Doctor's Office Explaining HIPAA, Enclosing HIPAA Compliant Authorization, and Detailing What Is Being Requested .....	239
Plaintiff's <i>Arons/Porcelli</i> Speaking Authorization for Defendants.....	241

### C. AUTOMOBILE NEGLIGENCE AND INSURANCE RELATED FORMS

Request for Copy of Accident Report (MV-198C).....	243
Driver's Privacy Protection Act (MV-15DPPA) .....	245
New York Motor Vehicle No-Fault Insurance Law .....	247
Notice and Proof of Claim for Disability Benefits (DB-450).....	275
Underinsured/Uninsured Notification Letter .....	277
Sample New York No-Fault Computation Sheet .....	278
Request for Driving Abstract .....	279
Letter of Representation to Defendant Owner and Driver .....	280
Pre-suit Demand Letter for Insurance Information Under Insurance Law § 3420(f)(2)(A).....	281

### D. COMMENCING THE LITIGATION

Application for Index Number.....	283
Request for Judicial Intervention (UCS-840) with Addendum (UCS-840A).....	285
Court Summons .....	289

\* The government forms contained in this monograph are omitted from the forms CD accompanying this publication. These forms are obtainable from the following government agencies: the Official New York City website (<[www.nyc.gov](http://www.nyc.gov)>), the New York State Unified Court System (1-800-268-7869; <[www.nycourts.gov](http://www.nycourts.gov)>), the New York State Department of Motor Vehicles (<[www.dmv.ny.gov/forms](http://www.dmv.ny.gov/forms)>; see website for local DMV telephone numbers), and the New York State Department of Financial Services (<[www.dfs.ny.gov](http://www.dfs.ny.gov)>; see website for appropriate telephone numbers).

Certificate of Merit (No Issue with Statute of Limitations) for Medical Malpractice Action .....	291
Verified Summons and Complaint in a Medical Malpractice Action Involving Wrongful Death of an Infant with Attorney Verification.....	293
Notice of Commencement of Medical Malpractice Action.....	299
Verified Summons and Complaint in an Automobile Negligence Case for Individual Plaintiff and Attorney Verification.....	301

**E. DISCOVERY AND AMPLIFICATION OF PLEADINGS**

Plaintiff’s Verified Bill of Particulars in a Medical Malpractice Action Involving Wrongful Death of an Infant.....	305
Plaintiff’s Notice of Availability for Physical Examination .....	323
Plaintiff’s Notice to Admit.....	325
Plaintiff’s General Combined Demands with a Demand for a Verified Bill of Particulars on Defendant’s Affirmative Defenses .....	327
Plaintiff’s Notice to Produce Documents in a Product Defect Case with Jurisdictional and Successor Liability Issues as to Certain Defendants.....	331
Plaintiff’s Combined Discovery Demands and Notice for Discovery and Inspection in Medical Malpractice Case.....	337
Deposition Exhibit List.....	365

**F. TRIAL AND VERDICT**

Note of Issue .....	367
Certificate of Readiness .....	369
Trial Exhibit List (Internal Use Only).....	371
Trial Notebook Index (Internal Use Only).....	373
Jury Selection Record (Internal Use Only).....	375
Trial Schedule .....	377
Plaintiff’s Request to Charge in a Medical Malpractice Case .....	381
Plaintiff’s Request to Charge in a Motor Vehicle Negligence Case .....	385
Plaintiff’s Proposed Verdict Sheet in a Medical Malpractice Case .....	389

**G. SETTLEMENT AND CLOSING OF A CASE**

General Release .....	401
Standard Stipulation of Discontinuance .....	402
CPLR 5003-a Letter to Defendant Transmitting Settlement Documents .....	403
Judicial Conference Closing Statement .....	405
Client Disbursement Accounting .....	407

**PATRICK J. HIGGINS, ESQ.**

Mr. Higgins practices in Albany, New York, at Powers & Santola, LLP, where he represents the seriously and catastrophically injured and their families. He also litigates environmental matters. In 2012 Mr. Higgins was named to *Best Lawyers in America* in the field of plaintiff's medical malpractice and plaintiff's personal injury practice, and was also listed as one of the top 25 lawyers in the Hudson Valley by *Super Lawyers*.<sup>TM</sup>

Mr. Higgins is the Editor-in-Chief and contributing author to the New York State Bar Association two-volume treatise *The Plaintiff's Personal Injury Action in New York*, published in 2008, with an update issuing in 2013. He has also since 2003 been the state chair for the New York State Bar Association's seminars "Handling Tough Issues in Personal Injury Litigation." Mr. Higgins is board certified by the National Board of Trial Advocacy in Trial Practice and is a graduate of the National Institute of Trial Advocacy (NITA) Master Advocacy Program. He is a past President of the Albany County Bar Association, a past member of the New York State Bar Association House of Delegates, and a past Fellow of the American Bar Foundation. Mr. Higgins has frequently spoken to attorneys' groups on trial practice and representing plaintiffs in personal injury matters.

Mr. Higgins has also spearheaded Albany County Bar Association programs held with fire, police and local hospitals to give free bike helmets to children and to educate children on safe biking. Mr. Higgins is a member of the Third Department's Independent Judicial Elections Qualification Commission, serving on behalf of the Third Judicial District.